DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 432 837 EA 029 993

AUTHOR Naidoo, Jordan P.
TITLE The Racial Integration of Schools: A Review of the Literature on the Experience in South Africa. EPU Working Paper No. 7.
INSTITUTION Natal Univ., Durban (South Africa). Education Policy Unit.
ISBN ISBN-1-86840-197-9
PUB DATE 1996-05-00
NOTE 58p.
PUB TYPE Information Analyses (070)
EDRS PRICE EDRS Price MF01 Plus Postage. PC Not Available from EDRS.
DESCRIPTORS *Desegregation Methods; Educational Change; Educational Policy; Elementary Secondary Education; Foreign Countries; Private Schools; Public Schools; Racial Integration; Racial Segregation; *School Desegregation; School Segregation
IDENTIFIERS *South Africa

ABSTRACT

This report outlines the history of desegregation in South African schools and explores the continuing strains arising from the process. It focuses on integration in the context of the various school models used in the country. The text describes how segregated education became institutionalized after the National Party came to power in 1948 and how the Soweto student uprisings in 1976 marked a turning point in the history of education in South Africa. Churches began to oppose segregated education and a rapidly expanding black middle class began to agitate for access to better education. The 1980s witnessed increases in reform activities, and a number of formal organizations were formed to combat segregation, leading to a gradual expansion of educational opportunities for people of color. In 1990, a new admissions policy for white state schools was introduced, which saw the creation of three new models of schools that allowed the enrollment of pupils other than those for which the school was originally intended. These models were followed by the election of the first democratic government in South Africa in 1994, which ushered in significant education policy changes. However, even with all of these changes, South African schools remain largely segregated today. (Contains approximately 140 references.) (RJM)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED 432 837

THE RACIAL INTEGRATION OF SCHOOLS:

A Review of the Literature on the Experience in South Africa

Jordan P. Naidoo

EPU Working Paper No. 7
May 1996

Education Policy Unit
University of Natal
Durban

EA 029 993

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

☑ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL IN MICROFICHE ONLY HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

J. Karlsson

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

2

2B

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

THE RACIAL INTEGRATION OF SCHOOLS:

A Review of the Literature on the Experience in South Africa

Jordan P. Naidoo

EPU Working Paper No. 7
May 1996

Education Policy Unit
University of Natal
Durban

THE RACIAL INTEGRATION OF SCHOOLS:
A Review of the Literature on the Experience in South Africa

By: Jordan P. Naidoo
Education Policy Unit

Published by the Education Policy Unit
University of Natal
Private Bag X10
Dalbridge 4014
South Africa
Tel: (031) 260-2607
Fax: (031) 260-2118

Copyright ©1996: Education Policy Unit

ISBN: 1-86840-197-9

CONTENTS

	PAGE
1. Introduction	1
2. Background	5
3. Desegregation in Private Schools	8
4. Pressure to Desegregate State Schools	12
5. The Clase Models	18
6. Post Apartheid Policies and Desegregation	28
7. References	36

1. INTRODUCTION

Historically in South Africa, there has been a separation of educational provision by race. Racialism in education can be traced back nearly three hundred years and segregation was strongly enforced after 1948 when the National Party (NP) came to power (Christie 1985).[1] In the 1970s, however, a limited number of black students were admitted to previously all-white private schools (Christie 1990).[2]

Limited desegregation began to take place in state schools after 1984 and in 1990 desegregation of state schools was given a boost with the introduction of the Clase Models.[3] From 1991, the South African government began to allow a few black (i.e. African, Indian and coloured) students to attend white state schools under certain stringent conditions.[4] At about the same time, Indian and coloured

---

[1]For a more comprehensive account of the history of segregated schooling refer to Africa Perspective (24) 1984; Cross and Chisholm (1990); Hartshorne (1992); Horrell (1963); Kallaway (1984); Rose and Tumner (1975); and SAIRR (Annual).

[2]This work provides a detailed account of desegregation of private schools with particular reference to racially mixed Catholic schools between 1976 and 1986. For integration of private schools in general see Bot (1987); Freer (1991); Nkomo (1990); Randall (1982); and Pampallis (1991).

[3]Metcalfe (1991), provides a summary of the models and the circumstances surrounding the introductions of these models.

[4]The terms 'African', 'Coloured', 'Indian', and 'White' are used in the text. These do not refer to the biological concept of race but to the political system of racial classification that underpinned apartheid education.

schools were beginning to submit to pressure to admit African students (Carrim 1992).

Although unrestricted formal desegregation by decree only came into being in 1995, by 1993 there were 60 000 black students at Model C schools and about 40 000 African or coloured students at Indian schools under the ex-House of Delegates (HoD), about 5% of the total pupil enrolment at these schools. By the end of 1995 this estimate had risen to between 10 and 15% or approximately 200 000.[5]

While the former white, Indian and coloured schools number almost 5 000, they make up only 20% of the total number of schools; however, they do comprise an important segment of the school system in South Africa in that they tend to be the best equipped schools and to have the best-qualified staff.

With the continuing demand of black students to attend schools from which they were previously barred, the number of black students at such schools will probably continue to increase. The process is likely to be accompanied by difficulties and challenges of various kinds, both social and academic, as more and more students from differing academic and cultural backgrounds come together.

Such problems have already arisen in some schools, most of which have different levels of desegregation. Some problems revolve around cultural misunderstandings, questions of

[5]Refer to South African Institute of Race Relations Survey 1993/1994 and 1994/1995 for a more detailed account of pupil enrolment statistics. In some cases annual reports of the different education departments also give a breakdown by race.

racism and exclusion and the nature of the integration process. Other problems involve academic issues associated with students who do not possess the levels of proficiency in English, Afrikaans, mathematics and science that are required by the schools they are entering.[6]

Besides the situation in individual schools there is also the question of long term policy regarding formerly racially exclusive, privileged schools in the education system as a whole.[7] The issue is more acute in the light of the latest proposal concerning categories of schools which states that future policy of the Ministry of Education is to have two broad categories of schools: public schools and independent schools (Education White Paper 2: 1996).

Consequently, the controversy surrounding the retention of Model C schools has flared up once again.[8] This makes it

---

[6] Bhana (1994); Ngubane (1993); Naidoo (1995); Penney et al (1993); Patel (1993); Seager (1994); Smith (1991); Snelling (1993); and Vice (1991), are some of the in-depth case studies relating to the process of school integration.

[7] See ANC Policy Framework for Education and Training; Nasson and Samuels (1990); NEPI (1993); and Unterhalter, Wolpe and Botha (1992). For policy options after the election of the Government of National Unity in 1994, refer to the two Education White Papers of March 1995 and February 1996 as well as policy pronouncements by the National Ministry and the Minister of Education since then. See also the report of the Hunter Commission on the organisation, governance and funding of schools.

[8] See Citizen 30/1/96: 'Government plays down Model C reports'; Star 31/1/96: 'NP attacks Metcalfe'; Citizen 2/2/96: 'Transform Model C Schools: ANC'; and Citizen 9/2/96: 'Model C schools to be scrapped'. In fact, there were numerous newspaper reports on this issue during the first quarter of 1996.

necessary to examine the process of integration in the context of these Models.

2. BACKGROUND

At present the post-apartheid Government of National Unity (GNU) is wrestling with a number of significant challenges, not least of which is the issue of transformation in the educational sphere. A unitary education system has been established and its vision clearly outlined, firstly as part of the Reconstruction and Development Programme (RDP), secondly through the March 1995 White Paper and more recently through the Hunter proposals and the second Education White Paper of February 1996. Also, certain curriculum changes have been initiated on a broad scale. However, the micro-changes involving desegregation and effective racial integration of schools for true transformation of apartheid education still lie ahead.[9]

As the changes up to now have shown, any further initiatives to facilitate the process of transformation and the removal of the legacies of apartheid must take into account the conditions that have evolved over a period of time and against a particular historical background as is highlighted by Mokubung Nkomo:

> *The future is embedded in the present as the present bears the imprints of the past. Therefore any project that is designed to contemplate a reconstruction of the future of education in a*

[9] Hindle (1995), provides an overview of the curriculum changes taking place during this period of transition and points to the future as well. See also Christie (1990a) and Taylor (1993) for curriculum issues related to issues of transformation.

> *transformed South Africa must first be grounded on a firm understanding of the genesis, evolution and nature of the current educational arrangement* (1990:291).

Education in South Africa has been characterised by segregation and unequal provision along racial, ethnic and class lines for nearly three centuries.[10] The policy of segregated education however, became entrenched and institutionalised through apartheid policies after the NP came to power in 1948.

The Eiselen Commission Report in 1951 and subsequent acts of parliament such as the Bantu Education Act of 1953, the Coloured Persons' Education Act of 1963 and the Indian Education Act of 1965, created separate education departments to oversee the education of the different population groups in line with the provisions of the apartheid doctrine of Christian National Education.[11] Racial segregation in education, besides reflecting the racial structure of apartheid, also served to cement this structure.

Not only was education segregated but from the outset there were great imbalances in the provision of education for the different groups and these grew ever wider with the

---

[10] See Africa Perspective 1984 (24): 41-64 and Molteno (1984).

[11] Refer to the Eiselen Commission Report and subsequent legislation dealing with education during Nationalist rule, from the Bantu Education Act of 1953 to legislation arising from the Educational Renewal Strategy of the 1990s. There are a number of works that offer an analysis of this legislation and the policies followed under Apartheid. Kallaway (1984) provides a bibliography of these works.

development of apartheid education. The education of African children in particular, was underfunded and characterised by a shortage of schools, equipment and adequately trained and qualified teachers. For example, the per capita educational spending, excluding salaries, for 1988/1989 (SAIRR 1990:795) and 1992/1993 (SAIRR 1992:690) [12], was as follows:

Per Capita Spending	1988/1989	1992/1993
White (HoA)	R3082.00	R4372.00
Indian (HoD)	R2227.01	R3702.00
Coloured (HoR)	R1358.78	R2902.00
DET (African)	R 764.73	R1659.00
Gazankulu	R 669.00	R1214.00
KaNgwane	R 520.00	R1046.00
KwaZulu	R 411.58	R1080.00

[12]SAIRR's annual survey provided an expenditure breakdown by race from 1951 to 1993, after which expenditure records according to race were not possible due to integration and also because of the political changes. See also Bunting (1971).

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

3. DESEGREGATION IN PRIVATE SCHOOLS

There had been ongoing resistance to apartheid education policies since the early fifties but it had little effect until the 1976 Soweto student uprisings.[13] Christie refers to this as a turning point in the history of education in South Africa and it marked the beginning of a period of struggle and contestation in education which carried on into the 1980s (Christie 1990:1).[14] After the Soweto uprisings of 1976, the government was forced to contemplate reforms and allow some very limited school desegregation, symptomatic of its larger reform strategy which was aimed at maintaining power by accommodating some of the demands of the black majority.[15]

---

[13]Maurice (1981) gives an historical overview of student protest in South Africa. Brooks & Brickhill (1981); Hallett (1977); Hirson (1979); Kane-Berman (1978); and SAIRR (1978), are in-depth investigations into the causes and details of the 1976 Soweto riots. For a review of the literature on Soweto 1976 see Molteno (1979).

[14]For more comprehensive analyses on the consequences of the Soweto riots see Mafaje (1982). Frederikse (1986) looks at the struggle after 1976. Gutteridge (1984) looks at struggle and contestation during the 1980s. Hill (1983) assesses trends of thought of different stakeholders in South Africa during the post-Soweto period and the confrontations of the early 80s and reflects on changes emanating from them.

[15]See Hyslop (1988) and Unterhalter (1991). For a critical look at the reform strategy in general refer to Riga (1985) and for a pro-government view van Vuuren (1985). For the Nationalist government's perspective see van der Merwe (1986). See also Human Sciences Research Council (1981).

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

In the 1970s, as part of a new emphasis on social justice, some churches began to oppose or reject the segregationist aspect of Bantu Education. The first organised attempt to desegregate white South African schools was made by private, fee-paying Catholic schools in 1976 and was largely completed by 1986. These actions were subsequently supported by the Anglican Archbishop and the Headmasters' Conference of the Protestant schools. The initiative to open the church schools did not occur as a single uncontested thrust, but once the impetus towards desegregation was established it was not to be halted (Christie 1990: 19) .[16]

The Human Sciences Research Council (HSRC) Committee Investigation into Education under the chairmanship of J.P. de Lange in 1981 recommended the following blueprint for the open schools movement:

- a single ministry of education (but still a segregated schooling system);
- free and compulsory education for all, regardless of race, colour, creed or gender;
- equal opportunities and equal standards;
- recognition and subsidisation for private schools;
- a blend of formal and non-formal education to be financed by both the state and the private sector (1991).

[16]See also Cross (1987); Hunter (1986); Kairos Theologians (1985); Prior (1982); and Southern African Catholic Bishops Conference (1980).

The government responded by reaffirming its policy of separate education departments with the National Policy for General Education Affairs Act in 1984. A "general affairs" Department of National Education (DNE) and "own affairs" departments for the four population groups were created (National Policy for General Education Affairs Act 1984).[17] However, there was a slight change in the government's attitude in response to the growing calls for some form of desegregated schooling.

Principle 8 of the HSRC Investigation into education in RSA known as the De Lange Commission Report stated that:

> *Provision shall be made for the establishment of and state subsidisation of private education within the system of providing education* (HSRC 1981: 15).

Muller identifies this change in attitude in Principle 8 of the De Lange Commission Report:

> *State subsidisation would imply South Africa's entering into a new phase in which private education will no longer be limited to a select minority who can afford it, but will become a means through which state assistance can be afforded to those who make particular demands on education which government schools cannot or will not meet* (1992: 43).

[17]See also 23 November 1983 White Paper on the Provision of Education in the Republic of South Africa.

One such "particular demand" was the demand of private schools to "open" their schools to all race groups. There was also a growing demand by the rapidly expanding black middle classes for access to better education. The principle of allowing desegregation of private schools was affirmed in 1986 through the Private Schools Act No. 104. Although this was a significant development in terms of official apartheid policy with regard to separate schooling, in actual terms it was a very small step because proportionately speaking, a minuscule number of pupils of race groups other than white attend private schools (Bot 1991).

4. PRESSURE TO DESEGREGATE STATE SCHOOLS

In the eighties, opposition to apartheid and apartheid education in particular, flared up again, beginning with the 1980 student boycotts in the Western Cape (Molteno 1987). Bantu Education was condemned and there were calls for the complete transformation of the education system. By 1985, through links with worker and community organisations and the mass-based United Democratic Front (UDF), student protests had become an integral part of a broader political movement.

In the 1980s the educational boycott had begun to assume a central role in educational struggle. It focused initially on limited student concerns, but moved on to rebel, not only against the repressive structures of Bantu Education but also against adult and parental authority in general. By the end of 1985 schooling had virtually ground to a standstill in the Witwatersrand and Western and Eastern Cape with about 650 000 students out on boycott (Moola and Eksteen 1991: 21).

It was in this context that the Soweto Parents Crisis Committee (SPCC) was formed in October 1985, to negotiate with the Department of Education and Training (DET) to attempt some resolution of the crisis. However, the negotiations were unsuccessful. The SPCC then called a national consultative conference to devise a strategy to take forward the educational struggle. This led to the formation

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

of the National Education Crisis Committee (NECC) in March 1986 in Durban.

In conjunction with the leadership of the National Education Crisis Committee, later to become the National Education Co-ordinating Committee (NECC) and the People's Education Campaign (PEC), there were calls for schools to be taken over and transformed. The "people's education movement" called for the eradication of apartheid education and the establishment of a single, non-racial, democratic system of education for all South Africans irrespective of race (Sisulu 1986).[18]

Although the state did introduce certain educational reforms and spending on black education was increased in this period, it also responded repressively by imposing a state of emergency (Hyslop 1988).[19]

Leading figures in commerce and industry, as well as certain elements within the government itself, began to express reservations about the manner in which the education crisis was being addressed. The primary concern was the economic effect of the on-going unrest but there was also mounting pressure on the government from black parents and the extra-parliamentary opposition to address the crisis in black education.[20]

---

[18]For an analysis of People's Education see Kruss (1988); Levin (1991); and Mashamba (1990).

[19]See also Nasson (1990).

[20]See Chisholm (1984); and Christie and Collins (1984).

At the same time, the accelerating process of urbanisation and class differentiation in the 1980s impacted on the tight fabric of apartheid cities. New social and economic forces emerged as Africans struggled to obtain access to core areas of the city and increased resources to make urban life on the periphery of the cities more amenable (Hindson et al 1993:1). The distribution of educational resources did not escape these pressures.

It was in this context that the open schools movement took shape. The government's response to the growing demand for the opening of state schools was still conditioned by the "own affairs" nature of the 1983 Constitution (Christie 1990: 12).

The government's position on open schools was presented by Piet Clase, the Minister of Education in the House of Assembly (HoA) in a meeting with the Open Schools Association in January 1989. The government's position with regard to desegregation of schools can be summarised as follows:

1) Preservation of cultural differences in education was necessary.

2) Under-utilisation of white schools was being compensated for by using schools for non-educational purposes.

3) Equality in education would not be achieved through integration.

4) The attitude of people seeking change in education was patronising and ethnocentric (Folb 1991:5).

The government was still strongly supportive of segregated education and clung to the concept of the "general affairs" DNE and four different departments for the "own affairs" of the four population groups. The insistence on clinging to a system of separate education on the basis of race which was justified by the idea of protecting cultural differences, is borne out by Minister Clase's statement of November 1988 :

> *The reality of a heterogeneous multiplicity of cultures and cultural communities in South Africa forms one of the basic principles upon which my department's policy rests. Education and culture cannot be separated. Religion, language, history, tradition, custom and usage must be incorporated by the child in a cultural tradition and ethos. A general cultural entity does not exist. This kind of person only exists in the dreams of utopians and universalists who would make of the world a colourless united community. It is an impossible task that cannot be justified educationally. It can only be forced on education by outside non-educational arguments. The truth is that education is inherently connected with upbringing, and upbringing with culture, and culture with a specific cultural community. Whoever wishes to cut this band will take away the educational basis of education.* (Folb, 1991:6)

Thus at this point, educational institutions for a particular population group could only provide education for other

groups by exception, on condition that the character and ethos of the institution was not jeopardised and preference was given to members of the population group for which the institution was established. For example, up until the introduction of the Clase Models in 1990, only the children of black diplomats and foreigners were allowed to attend white schools. In House of Delegates (HoD) schools one such exception was the enrolment of foreign exchange students who were generally not Indian.

For some years coloured, Indian and African education departments had had a policy of flexible admission criteria but little integration of pupils from other population groups had taken place. In 1985, schools falling under the HoD and the House of Representatives (HoR) began desegregation on a greater scale, thus pre-dating the process of integration in white state schools. The decision to integrate appears to have been taken by principals (with or without permission from the relevant minister) and was not part of a national policy.

Factors that promoted the opening of these schools were united opposition to "gutter education" and the demand for education by out-of-school African students. There were also demands from professional and semi-professional middle-income black parents for their children to attend these schools. They were seen as an escape from the disruptions in the black schools and a means of obtaining a "better" education for their children (Hindle and Morrell 1993: 80).[22]

[22]See also Bhana (1994); Carrim (1992); Metcalfe (1991); Naidoo (1995); Ngubane (1993); and Patel (1993).

But even in these schools, between 1985 and 1990 the enrolment of African pupils was minimal. However, Carrim points out that African enrolment rates at these schools increased considerably between 1990 and 1991 and makes the claim that apartheid norms were breaking down at these schools (Carrim 1992: 3). In view of the total segregation of the past the integration of this period was somewhat dramatic at these schools. However, even though there was now some desegregation, the general ethos of these schools remained the same as before (Carrim and Mkwanazi 1993).[23]

[23]See also Carrim and Sayed (1991) and Morrell (1991).

5. THE CLASE MODELS

As the eighties drew to a close and a new decade began, a number of momentous developments in the broader political sphere in South Africa impacted significantly on education and more specifically on state educational provision. President F.W. De Klerk's landmark speech of 2 February 1990 ushered in a significant shift away from constitutionally-based racism.

Subsequent changes in the Group Areas legislation, the formation of so-called "grey" or free settlement areas and the accompanying demographic changes brought tremendous pressure to bear on state educational structures and policy and on schools under the control of the different departments, but particularly on white schools in these areas.

These demographic changes resulted in a growing number of empty places in white schools, with 26% of white primary and secondary school places not being filled. The increase in white emigration, the fall in the white birth-rate and the exodus of white people from the city centres to the suburbs with the influx of blacks into the cities all had an influence on this.

The student teacher ratios at these schools dropped to alarmingly uneconomical levels. In fact, with the rapid decline in white pupil enrolments in the ten years up to 1990, 203 white schools had been closed and many more were in danger of closure. At the same time there was a

shortage of 60 343 primary and 99 506 secondary school classroom places in DET schools (Bot 1991: 24).

The drop in pupil enrolments at these white schools also put in jeopardy thousands of white teachers' posts and it seemed more than likely that a number of white teachers would be retrenched. Here again, in stark contrast, black schools were facing a dire shortage of adequately qualified teachers.

Another factor that impacted on the whole issue of school desegregation was the economic crisis that the country was experiencing, especially with regard to manpower needs. There was a growing demand for more skilled labour and with black education being perceived as inadequate to satisfy these needs, it was argued that integrated schooling would enable a select number of black pupils to receive a reasonable standard of education in the "open schools" and contribute to satisfying some of these needs.

Thus in 1991, in the wake of broader political changes, a lurching process of desegregation began in state schools. The Clase Models, which ushered in the integration of state schools under certain stringent conditions, were introduced in the context of the rationalisation of educational resources as well as the broader political changes that were taking place (Metcalfe 1991).

On 10 September 1990, Minister Clase announced a new admission policy for white state schools. The new policy gave white parent communities the choice of retaining the status quo in their schools or adopting one of three new models which gave them control over admissions. These

were models A, B, and C which came to be known as the Clase Models. These models can be described as follows:

MODEL A: A model for privatisation. The white school closes and reopens as a private school. It is run by a management committee or board of governors which employs staff, sets conditions of service and dictates the terms of pupil admission. The state provides a 45% subsidy as long as certain criteria are met concerning curricula and facilities.

MODEL B: A state school option. The school remains a state school under a management committee within departmental regulations. Salaries of staff and most operating costs would be borne by the state. There would be an "open" admissions policy.

MODEL C: A state-aided school that is run by a management committee and the principal. A prescribed number of teachers are paid by the state while the rest of the expenses are borne by the school community. The management committee has the power to appoint teachers, decide on admission policy, deal with curriculum development and impose fees to cover costs. School resources such as grounds and buildings are transferred to the school community and its management committee.

The management committee had to follow certain stringent procedures in order to opt for one of the above models. The parent body had to be polled and there had to be 80% participation and 90% support for a particular model for the school to be able to apply to the minister to change its

admission policy. In effect, a 72% majority had to be attained to effect any changes (Clase 1990).[24]

Mkwanazi and Carrim identified the following additional conditions that all the models had to abide by :

- All schools had to maintain ă 51% white majority in their school population.
- The cultural ethos of the school was to remain intact.
- The management councils of the schools had the right to determine selection criteria.
- No school was necessarily bound to consider curricular changes.
- The opening of schools did not necessarily mean the employment of black teachers on the staff of such open schools.
- The financing of the black pupils at these schools was the responsibility of the black parent and child (Carrim and Mkwanazi 1993: 13).

[24]Metcalfe (1991) provides a summary of the models and the circumstances surrounding the introduction of these models. Coutts (1992) locates the introduction of the Clase Models in the context of South Africa and multicultural education. A challenge to this perspective is offered by Nzimande (1991) in an unpublished paper delivered at a conference at Edgewood Training College in June 1991 on multi-cultural admissions, policy and practice.

At the end of 1991 a fourth model - **MODEL D** was introduced. It was similar to Model B, the major difference being that there was no restriction regarding the number of black pupils that could be enrolled in the school. In fact, these became schools for black children run by the "white" department of education.

The Clase Models signalled an official sanction to enrol pupils other than those for which the school was originally intended. However, a wide range of criticisms can be levelled, not only against the Clase Models, but against the way the whole process of school desegregation had been handled by the government since 1985.

Although some integration had been introduced by the government, deracialisation to any significant degree had not taken place. The models and the multicultural strategies underpinning them may even advance racism by reinforcing stereotypes and by the general race orientation of teachers and pupils (Carrim and Mkwanazi 1993: 13-17).

The initial criticism focused on the restrictive criteria for the admission of black pupils to white schools. This was interpreted as an attempt to ensure that the better resources of white schools were reserved for certain groups and that white privilege and dominance was maintained within these educational institutions.

Black parents found it difficult to enrol their children in the new desegregated schools. In many cases black parents were turned away by management committees on the basis of

meritocratic criteria which masked explicit racism (Metcalfe 1991: 20). [25]

Criticisms also centred around the reasons and motivations for the introduction of the Clase Models. It has been argued that it was not an altruistic or sincere attempt to address the crisis in education in South Africa, especially with regard to the provision of equal educational opportunities for all South Africans regardless of race or colour, or even to deracialise schools.

Sayed and Carrim claimed that the Clase Models were actually an attempt to address the crisis in white education by cutting down on the number of white teaching posts that were in danger, preventing the closure of certain white schools that had become economically unfeasible and to shifting the financing and control of white schools to white parents (1992: 28-29).

Privatisation of education was in line with the development of parastatals such as Telkom and Spoornet, with the school becoming a commercial enterprise and education being presented as a saleable commodity for the benefit of those who could afford it. Hindle and Morrell point out that one of the implications of educational privatisation was that the school system would be divided between a multi-racial, privileged middle class and the mass of (black) school-goers who would remain in under-resourced environments (1993: 102).

[25] See also Carrim and Mkwanazi (1993); Carrim and Sayed (1991 & 1992); and Freer (1992).

The imposition of high school fees made these schools inaccessible to the majority of blacks and only a small elite could afford to attend them. Thus racial discrimination was replaced by class discrimination. The new open schools could hardly claim to be truly deracialised and the social inequities of the past, largely based on race, were maintained and strengthened.

The focus on culture in the Clase Models was not a new concern of the government, as is clear from Minister Clase's previously quoted statement. This concern, which perhaps explains to some extent the advocacy of multicultural strategies in the context of the Clase models, can be clearly recognised in the Minister's comments to the House of Assembly on 30 January 1988 :

Quite apart from the bureaucratic inertia which would result from a single system of educational control and management, from the educational point of view a single department is not acceptable. Education and schooling are processes whereby a specific child is educated to responsible adulthood within a particular culture by members of that culture. The government protects the rights of groups and individuals in this regard by means of own affairs education. The government does not have an idealist concept of the imaginary, autonomous individual who may exist in theory or in reality and who has the right and the freedom to ignore all existing recognised group rights and group freedoms. Such a simplistic view would demolish the very foundation of group rights (Folb 1991:6).

Although after 1991 the government accepted and reaffirmed its change of heart with regard to the

establishment of a single ministry of education in the principles contained in the Educational Renewal Strategy (ERS) document and expressly stated that race should no longer feature in the provision of education, it continued to stress the right to an 'own' culture, language and religion.

With the changing political landscape after 1992, the setting up of the Clase Models was challenged by both the NECC and the ANC. Blade Nzimande stressed the ANC's rejection of the Clase Models in no uncertain terms at a conference on Multicultural Admissions held at Edgewood Training College on 15 June 1991:

> *We as the ANC must say that we do not regard these models as the opening of schools. To us this is simply an attempt to save white schools which are presently threatened with closure as a result of the diminishing numbers in them. We are not saying that schools should be closed. But it is clear to us that the solution is not to open them to a few blacks while ensuring that they remain unchanged in their character and ethos* (Nzimande 1991:3).

The ANC Policy Framework for Education and Training made it quite clear that there would have to be a total transformation of the education system as the system was fragmented along racial and ethnic lines and was saturated with the racial ideology and education doctrines of apartheid (ANC Education Department: 1994).

The introduction of the Clase Models had some impact on African enrolments in "Indian" (ex-HoD) and "coloured" (ex-HoR) schools as well. These schools could now admit

African students under similar conditions laid down for white schools in the Clase Models.

In contrast to the white schools, the changes in Indian and coloured schools occurred almost unnoticed, without official public announcements or media attention. The decision to allow Indian schools to admit African students officially was transmitted to them by the Director of Education for the HoD. This was a tacit admission that many of the Indian schools had already been admitting non-Indian students (Penney et al 1993:414).

The distinct increase in the enrolment of African students in Indian schools from 1985 to 1991 is clear from the following statistics adapted from the ex-House of Delegates Annual Reports:

YEAR	AFRICAN ENROLMENT AT EX-HOD SCHOOLS
1986-1989	803
1990	1 260
1991	4 200
1992	21 221

However, the guidelines given to principals to regulate the entry of African students into Indian schools were in line with the basic principles of the Clase Models as is clear from the following:

- the character of the school shall not be prejudiced;

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

- accommodation and other facilities can be made available only after provision for Indian pupils is made;

- the medium of instruction is one of the two official languages (i.e. English and Afrikaans);

- pupils shall be easily assimilated into the relevant class (Bot 1991: 16).

The similarities between these conditions and those of the Clase Models are clear, especially in terms of preserving the ethos of the school. These conditions encouraged a typical assimilationist mode of desegregation. The curricula followed were not multicultural and where African experiences were presented in white, Indian and coloured schools they were often stereotyped and made to seem inferior (Carrim and Mkwanazi 1993: 16).

Many Indian schools, especially those bordering on the African townships and those situated close to the burgeoning squatter camps, had to cope with a sudden influx of African students. Schools in the metropolitan areas were particularly affected. The increased levels of violence and changes occurring in the metropolitan areas may also have influenced the influx of African students into these schools.

6. POST-APARTHEID POLICIES AND DESEGREGATION

The election of the first democratic government in South Africa in April 1994 ushered in certain significant education policy changes which were to have a direct bearing on school desegregation and integration. The White Paper on Education and Training affirmed the fundamental right to education and training of all persons in terms of the preamble to the 1993 Constitution which declares:

> *the need to create a new order in which all South Africans shall be entitled to a common South African citizenship in a sovereign and democratic constitutional state in which there is equality between men and women and people of all races so that all citizens shall be able to exercise their fundamental rights and freedoms* (Interim Constitution March 1994: 39).

The White Paper goes further in affirming the right to equal access to educational institutions. It states that:

> *Section 32(a) (of the Constitution) confers on all persons the right of equal access to educational institutions. The precise intention of this provision must be to establish a condition of equality and non-discrimination with respect to access to educational institutions. It is a provision which can only be satisfied by the exercise of equal and non*

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

> *discriminatory policies on the part of educational institutions* (1994:40-41).

In addition, it stressed that to redress imbalances generated through historical inequalities of the past, ways had to be found to encourage children to attend schools that formerly excluded them. From the outset it was clear that one of the fundamental principles of education policy in the new democratic South Africa would be the racial integration of all educational institutions.

While a truly integrated schooling system is at the heart of the vision for a new educational future, in practice it is much more difficult to realise, especially in the short term. Although a unified national education department has been established and has been fully functional for over a year, the schooling system remains largely separate.

At the same time one must acknowledge that desegregation is not just a question of policy but also of social, economic and demographic realities. For example, the effects of "group areas" and residential segregation will affect the process for some time to come. Furthermore, high school fees in the so-called "advantaged" schools will inhibit school integration. South Africa's demography will also ensure that most schools will never be racially integrated but remain exclusively African.

However, the new government and education authorities have affirmed their intention to ensure that the schooling system becomes desegregated in practice. To this end, the Hunter Proposals focusing on school governance and the subsequent White Papers (November 1995 and February

1996), state clearly that there should be just two categories of schools in future: public schools and independent schools. The Draft Education White Paper 2, entitled 'The Organisation, Governance and Funding of Schools' emphasises that:

> *The act of renaming all schools in the public sector as public schools will also make a fundamental point of policy: All public schools embody the broad public interest in education and need to be organised, governed and resourced in a manner which is faithful to the Constitution, and which enables the government to discharge its obligations under the Constitution. Foremost among these obligations is the need to base the public provision of schooling for all South African children on the principles of equity and redress of past inequality and discrimination.* (Folb 1991:6)

Once again some of the larger issues regarding the need to ensure that the school system becomes truly desegregated have been side-tracked in some quarters by media hysteria generated around the question of the future of the Model C schools. For example, Leanne Seeliger (Mercury 11/01/1996) asks whether there is not a great need to maintain "centres of excellence" like Model C schools.

The government and those against the Model C system have made it clear that they will not support a system that excludes the majority and perpetuates racial and class discrimination in public education. In the same article Dr Blade Nzimande, chairperson of National Portfolio Committee on Education, is quoted as saying:

> *The ANC wants to transform the education system as a whole and do away with apartheid models of education, including the Model C schools ... We can't maintain islands of privilege in our new education system* (Mercury 11/01/1996).

For all the changes that have occurred thus far and the ongoing controversy surrounding the future of the Model C schools, the reality is that racial integration of public schools still has a long way to go. Except for some Model C schools and pockets of ex-HoD schools that were previously reserved for Indians, where there is now a minimal level of racial integration, most public schools are still racially exclusive in practice.

The moves towards integration up to now are only the first steps in a process towards the total transformation of the segregated system decreed by apartheid. Although the formal barriers to discrimination have been removed, the racial values and practices of many communities still remain. At present the national average of black pupils at formerly white or Indian schools does not exceed 15-20%.

The way in which schools adapt to increased integration is critical. The responses of schools to the present situation have been varied. Some schools have embraced the changes and are experimenting with new approaches and curricula which challenge old apartheid educational practices. For example, Laërskool Venterpos, a school on the West Rand, Gauteng, is experimenting with parallel-medium and dual-medium teaching.

Some classes are in English only, some in Afrikaans only and some are dual-medium. There is successful integration of pupils in a number of schools but according to Mary Metcalfe, Gauteng MEC for Education, racial integration in schools is in its honeymoon phase and much of the real work in eroding stereotypical racial attitudes must still take place (Mail & Guardian 8/3/96).[26]

Others are less bold. For example, Christiana, a small town in the North West province, which had one primary and one high school, both with declining enrolment figures, combined the two in anticipation of the requirement to desegregate. The primary school was taken over by the Conservative Party which planned to turn it into a retirement village for elderly white people until, at the beginning of 1995, students from the township marched on the school and demanded that it be re-opened as a school.

It has since reopened as a school for black children but the principal has been isolated by the local white community (Chisholm 1995). A similar situation developed in Delmas/Sundra in Mpumulanga and at Trompsburg in the Free State to name just two others.

Other discriminatory actions have also been reported. In Mpumalanga the Ben Viljoen Hoërskool, an Afrikaans-medium high school in Groblersdal, refused to allow black pupils to wear the school's uniform and placed black pupils and white pupils in separate classrooms. At Hoërskool Vryberg in the North West Province, black pupils were put

[26] For other interesting approaches see Berens, Potenza and Versveld (1992); Christie (1993); Lemmer and Squelch (1993); Spitz (1992) (video cassette).

into the school hall and left there for three weeks without lessons. The situation was so severe that of the 100 black students who had registered at the school at the beginning of 1996, only 8 remain (Business Day 7/3/1996).

In all of these cases the education departments concerned challenged the actions of individual schools and communities who were forced to accept open and non-discriminatory educational provision as protected by the Constitution. The Potgietersrus incident during the first quarter of 1996, which aroused much media attention and led the Education Department of the Northern Province to challenge the governing body in court about its refusal to admit black students, highlights the severity of the problems related to the whole issue of school integration.

According to Alexander, an intractable problem in the area of social policy is our understanding of the relationship of language, culture and nation (1990:195). With regard to school integration in South Africa, the issue of language, culture and nation is not just a policy issue but a practical one, as highlighted by the controversy over language admission policies at schools and calls for schools to address the cultural, language and religious needs of particular minorities. For example, the Gauteng School Education Bill has been referred to the Constitutional Court on this issue.

Minority groups argue that language testing prohibitions violate the right to establish, where practicable, educational institutions based on a common culture, language and religion, provided there shall be no discrimination on the grounds of race (Business Day 1/3/1996).

The Constitutional Court, in its decision of April 1996, held that the bill was not unconstitutional. The judgment stated that a person shall have the right, in association with others, to establish education institutions based on a common culture, language or religion, where this is reasonably practicable and provided there is no discrimination on the grounds of race.

This section does not create an obligation on the State to establish such schools, but rather protects the rights of individuals to do so. The Court also held that it did not appear that the governing bodies of such schools (Model C) had ever had the power to conduct language testing as an admission policy, such policy decisions being the preserve of the government (Wits Law School 1996).

In similar vein, the National Education Policy Bill 83 of 1995 was referred to the Constitutional Court and the judgment in this case was that the provinces must comply with national standards, which have been formulated in accordance with the Constitution and lawfully made applicable to them (Wits Law School 1996).

However, despite the need to secure and respect the Constitutional rights of minorities, in the context of school integration it is necessary to take cognisance of the divisive legacy of apartheid and the question of nation building in the new South Africa, where, in reality, there is considerable overlapping and mingling of cultures.

Morrow warns against a schooling policy that is deliberately designed to respect cultural differences as it is highly likely to create differences which might not otherwise have existed

and to accentuate and perpetuate the differences that already exist in our society (1989:60). There is the danger that such a policy will perpetuate, not only segregation of schooling but also the underlying inequalities in education.

The challenges facing the national and provincial education ministries, local communities and individual schools, to ensure that schools are truly integrated, will remain for some time. Clearly much more work is needed to understand the educational issues at stake and to make integrated schools a reality.

7. REFERENCES

Africa Perspective. 1984. The Historical Roots of Bantu Education. Africa Perspective (24).

African National Congress Education Department. 1994. A policy framework for education and training. Johannesburg: ANC.

Alexander, N. 1990. Education and the struggle for national liberation in South Africa. Johannesburg: Skotaville Publishers.

Arkin, A.J. 1989. The Indian South Africans: a contemporary profile. Pinetown: Owen Burgess Publishers.

Bekker, S. 1994. Ethnicity in focus. the South African case. Durban: Centre For Social and Developmental Studies, University of Natal, Durban.

Berens, P.; Potenza, E.; and Versfeld, R. 1992. Making a difference: ideas for change in schools. Cape Town: IDASA/Oxford University Press.

Berger, M. 1995. The integration of schooling in South Africa: a select South African bibliography. Durban: EPU, University of Natal.

Bhana, D. 1994. Indian teachers and African pupils in a desegregating school in Durban: a case of turning the other

into the same? M.Ed. Research Report, University of Natal, Durban. Unpublished.

Bot, M. 1991. The blackboard debate: hurdles, options and opportunities in school integration. Johannesburg: SAIRR.

Bot, M. 1987. The fifth stream: open education and private schools. Indicator South Africa, 5(1):41-46.

Braddock, J.H. 1985. School desegregation and black assimilation. Journal of Social Issues, 41 (3):9-22.

Brooks, A. and Brickhill, J. 1981. Whirlwind before the storm: the origins of the uprising in Soweto and the rest of South Africa from June to December 1976. London: International Defence and Aid Fund for Southern Africa.

Bunting, B. 1971. Education for apartheid. London: Christian Action for the Southern Africa Education Fund.

Carrim, N. 1995. From race to ethnicity: shifts in the education discourses of S.A. & Britain in the 1990s. Compare, 25 (1):17-33.

Carrim, N. 1992. Desegregation in coloured and Indian schooling. Johannesburg: University of Witwatersrand.

Carrim, N. and Mkwanazi, Z. 1993. From apartheid to modern racism: the case of open schools in South Africa. In L. Hudson, Y. Shalem and D. Bensusan (eds). Kenton at Broederstroom 1992 Conference Proceedings. Johannesburg: University of Witwatersrand.

Carrim, N. and Sayed, Y. 1992. Pay as you learn. Work in Progress, 84:28-29.

Carrim, N. and Sayed, Y. 1991. Open schools: reform or transformation. Work in Progress, 74:21-24.

Central Statistical Services. 1994. RSA - statistics in brief. Pretoria: CSS.

Centre for Adult and Continuing Education (CACE). 1987. People's education: a collection from December 1985 to May 1987. Bellville: University of the Western Cape.

Centre for Educational Research and Innovation (CERI). 1989. One school, many cultures. Paris: Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD).

Chetty, D. 1992. Identity and Indianness: reading and writing ethnic discourses. Paper presented at the Conference on Ethnicity, Society and Conflict in Natal. University of Natal, Pietermaritzburg. Unpublished.

Chisholm, L. 1995. EPU Quarterly Review (2) 4.

Chisholm, L. 1984. Redefining skills: black education in South Africa in the 1980s. In Kallaway, P. (ed). Apartheid and education: the education of black South Africans.

Christie, P. 1993. School desegregation and curriculum in South Africa: a case study. In N. Taylor (ed) Inventing Knowledge. Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

Christie, P. 1991. The right to learn: the struggle for education in South Africa. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

Christie, P. 1990. Open schools: racially mixed catholic schools in South Africa, 1976-1986. Johannesburg: Ravan Press. 1990.

Christie, P. 1990a. The private open schools and reform, 1976 - 1986. Education in South Africa: Past, Present and Future. New Jersey: Africa World Press.

Christie, P. 1990. Reforming the racial curriculum: curriculum change in desegregated schools in South Africa. British Journal of Sociology of Education 11(1):37-48.

Christie, P. and Collins, C. 1984. Bantu education: apartheid ideology and labour reproduction. In Kallaway, P. (ed). Apartheid and education: the education of black South Africans.

Clase, P.J. 1990. Additional models for the provision of schooling: information document. Pretoria: Department of Education - House of Assembly.

Cohen, L and Manion, L. 1983. Multicultural classrooms. Kent: Croom Helm.

Cohen, P. 1988. The perversion of inheritance: studies in the making of multi-racist Britain. In Cohen and Bains (eds). Multi-Racist Britain. London: MacMillan.

Connel, R.W. 1993. Schools and social justice. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.

Constitution of the Republic of South Africa. 1993. (Act 200 of 1993).

Corson, D. 1991. Language, power and minority schooling. Language and Education, 5(4):231 - 253.

Coutts, A. 1991. Schooling models and admission policy. Paper presented at a workshop arranged by the HSRC at Edgewood Training College. Unpublished.

Coutts, A. 1992. Multi-cultural education: the way ahead. Pietermaritzburg: Shuter and Shooter.

Cross, M. 1987. The road to non-racial education in South Africa: the case of the catholic "open" schools in the Transvaal, 1976-1986. Education in Society (5)1&2.

Cross, M. 1986. A historical review of education in South Africa: towards an assessment. Comparative Education, 22(3):185-200.

Cross, M. and Chisholm, L. 1990. The roots of segregated schooling in twentieth century South Africa. In M. Nkomo (ed). Pedagogy of Domination, New Jersey: Africa World Press.

Daniels, G. 1991. Fighting for 203 schools for 3 million kids. Work in Progress 78:20-22.

Department of Education. 1996. Education White Paper 2. Pretoria: DoE.

Department of Education. 1995. Draft Education White Paper 2. The organisation, governance and funding of schools. Pretoria: DoE.

Department of Education. 1995. Hunter report of the committee to review the organisation, governance and funding of schools. Pretoria: DoE.

Department of Education. 1995. Education White Paper. Pretoria: DoE.

Epstein, J. L. 1985. After the bus arrives: resegregation in desegregated schools. Journal of Social Issues, 41(3):23-43.

Folb, P.I. 1991. Open schools movement in South Africa 1986-1990: social revolution or epiphenomenon. Africa Seminar Paper, University of Cape Town. Unpublished.

Frederikse, J. 1992. All schools for all children: lessons for South Africa from Zimbabwe's open schools. Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

Frederikse, J. 1986. South Africa: A different kind of war - from Soweto to Pretoria. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

Freer, D. (ed). 1992. Towards open schools: possibilities and realities for non-racial education in South Africa. Manzini: MacMillan Boleswa.

Freund, B. 1995. Insiders and outsiders: the Indian working class of Durban 1910-1990. Pietermaritzburg: University of Natal Press.

Furlong, V.J. 1991. Disaffected pupils: reconstruction of the sociological perspective. British Journal of the Sociology of Education,12 (3):298-306.

Gaganakis, G.M. 1990. Perceptions of black pupils in non-racial private schools in Johannesburg. M.Ed. Thesis. Johannesburg: University of Witwatersrand.

Gerard, H.B. and Miller, N. 1975. School desegregation: a long-term study. New York: Plenum Press.

Gilborn, D. 1995. Racism and antiracism in real schools. Buckingham: Oxford University Press.

Gollnick, D.M. and Chinn, P.C. 1986. Multicultural education in a pluralistic society. Columbus: Merril.

Grant, C.A. (ed). 1992. Research and multicultural education: from the margins to the mainstream. London: Falmer Press.

Gutteridge, W. 1984. South Africa: evolution or revolution? Conflict Studies, 171.

Hallett, R. 1977. New winds of change: South Africa, 1966-1976 and the burden of black grievances: Soweto and Cape Town 1976. History Workshop, Centre for Extramural Studies, University of Cape Town. Unpublished.

Hartshorne, K.B. 1992. Crisis and challenge: black education 1910-1990. Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

Hill, C.R. 1983. Change in South Africa: blind alleys or new directions. London: Collings.

Hindle, D. 1995. A review of curriculum development structures and processes in South Africa, 1994-1995. Durban: Education Policy Unit, University of Natal.

Hindle, D. and Morrell, R. 1993. Education. South African Human Rights Yearbook, 3:94-110.

Hindson, D.; Byerley, M. and M. Morris. 1993. From violence to reconstruction. CSDS Working Paper No. 10. Durban: CSDS, University of Natal.

Hirson, B. 1979. Year of fire, year of ash: Soweto - roots of a revolution? London: Zed Press.

Horrell, M. 1963. African Education: Some Origins and Developments since 1963. Johannesburg: South African Institute for Race Relations (SAIRR).

House of Delegates. Annual Reports. 1986-1992.

Huberman, A. M. 1973. Understanding change in education: an introduction. Paris: UNESCO.

Human Sciences Research Council. 1981. Provision of education in the RSA: report of the main committee of the HSRC Committee into Education. Pretoria: HSRC.

Human Sciences Research Council. 1985. The South African society: realities and future prospects. Main

committee: investigation into intergroup relations. Pretoria: HSRC.

Hunter, P. 1986. Miseducation through silence: issues of social awareness and Christian responsibility in the historically white catholic school. Grace and Truth, 60-75.

Hyslop, J. 1988. School student movements and state education policy: 1972-87. In W. Cobbet and R. Cohen (eds). 1988. Popular Struggles in South Africa. Sheffield: Africa World Press.

Kairos theologians. 1985. Challenge to the church: a theological comment of the political crisis in South Africa. Johannesburg.

Kalley, J. A. 1987. South Africa under apartheid: a select and annotated bibliography. Pietermaritzburg: Shuter and Shooter.

Kallaway, P. (ed). 1984. Apartheid and education. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

Kane-Berman, J. 1978. Soweto: black revolt, white reaction. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

Kruss, G. 1988. People's education: an examination of the concept. Cape Town: Centre for Adult and Continuing Education, University of the Western Cape.

Lemmer, E. and Squelch, J. 1993. Multicultural education: a teacher's manual. Halfway House: Southern Book Publishers.

Levin, R. 1991. People's Education and the Struggle for Democracy in South Africa. In Unterhalter, E. et al (eds). 1991. Apartheid Education and Popular Struggles. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

Mafaje, A. 1982. Soweto and its aftermath. in South African capitalism and black political opposition. Cambridge: Schenkman.

Mashamba, G. 1990. A conceptual critique of the people's education discourse. Review of African Political Economy (48).

Maurice, E. 1981. What did you learn at school today? Eighty years of educational protest. Sash.

McCarthy, C. and Crichlow, W. (eds). 1993. Race, identity and representation in education. NewYork: Routledge.

McCarthy, C. 1990. Race and curriculum: social inequality and the theories and politics of difference in contemporary research on schooling. Lewes: Falmer Press.

McGregor, R. and McGregor, A. (eds). 1992. McGregor's educational alternatives. Cape Town: Juta.

Meier, J.K., Stewart, J. and England, R.E. 1989. Race, class and education: the politics of second generation discrimination. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press.

Metcalfe, M. 1991. Desegregating education in South Africa: white school enrolments in Johannesburg, 1985-

1991: update and policy analysis. Johannesburg: University of Witwatersrand.

Modgil, S., Verma, G.K., Mallick, K., and Modgil, C (eds). 1986. Multicultural education: the interminable debate. London: Falmer Press.

Molteno, F. 1987. 1980 - Students struggle for their schools. Cape Town: Centre for African Studies.

Molteno, F. 1984. The historical foundations of the schooling of black South Africans. In P. Kallaway (ed). Apartheid and Education. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

Molteno, F. 1979. The uprising of 16th June: a review of the literature on events in South Africa 1976. Social Dynamics, (5)1.

Moodley, K. and Adam, H. 1993. The opening up of the apartheid mind: options for the new South Africa. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Moola N. and Eksteen, S. 1971. School students' perceptions of people's education: a case study of Bosmont and Lenasia. PIE, 12(2):19-32.

Moore, B. 1993. Multicultural Education in South Africa: Some Theoretical Issues. Unpublished.

Morrell, R. 1991. Lessons from abroad: the deracialisation debates. Indicator, 8(4):65-68.

Morrow, W. 1989. Chains of thought: philosophical essays in South African education. Johannesburg: Southern Book Publishers.

Muller, J. 1992. The context of private and alternative schooling in South Africa: a review of private and alternative schooling, 1890-1990. In Freer, D. (ed). Towards open schools: possibilities and realities for non-racial education in South Africa. Manzini: MacMillan Boleswa.

Muller, J. and Badat, S. 1991. Open schools. New Era, 6(1):28.

Naidoo, J. P. 1995. School desegregation and the process of racial integration: a case study of Isipingo secondary: 1993-1995. M. Ed. Thesis. University of Natal.

Nasson, B. 1990. Education Reform and the State. In Nkomo (ed). Pedagogy of Domination: toward a democratic education in South Africa. New Jersey: Africa World Press.

Nasson, B. and Samuels, J. (eds) 1990. Education: from poverty to liberty. Cape Town: David Philip.

National Education Policy Investigations. 1992. Framework and Final Reports Summaries. Cape Town: Oxford University Press/NECC.

Ngubane, N. 1993. Integration process in Southlands high school, Chatsworth, Durban in 1991-1992: results and implications. M.Ed. Research Report, University of Natal.

Nkomo, M. (ed). 1990. Pedagogy of domination: toward a democratic education in South Africa. New Jersey: Africa World Press.

Nzimande, B. 1991. 'The ANC perspective on multi-cultural education.' Paper presented at a workshop arranged by the HSRC at Edgewood Training College. Unpublished.

Pampallis, J. 1991. Private schooling: problems of elitism and democracy in education. In Unterhalter, E., Wolpe H. and Botha T.(eds). Education in a future South Africa: policy issues for transformation. London: Heineman.

Patel, R. 1993. Manifestations of social closure integrating state secondary schools. M.SocSc Thesis, University of Natal.

Penny, A. et al. 1993. 'Just sort of fumbling in the dark': a case study of the advent of racial integration in South African schools. Comparative Education Review, 37(4):412-433.

Prior, A. (ed). 1982. Catholics in apartheid society. Cape Town: David Philip.

Randall, P. 1982. Little England on the veld: the English private school system in South Africa. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

Riga, D. 1985. Political Machinations of the Racist Regime. International Affairs.

Rist, R.C. (ed) 1979. Desegregated schools: appraisals of an American experiment. New York: Academic Press.

Rist, R.C. 1974. The invisible children: school integration in American society. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

Rizvi, F. 1993. Critical Introduction: Researching Racism and Education. In Troyna, B. (ed). Racism and education. Buckingham: Oxford University Press.

Rose, B. and Tumner, R. 1975. Documents in South African education. Johannesburg: Ad Jonker.

Rossell, C. H. and Hawley, W.D. (eds) 1983. The consequences of school desegregation. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.

Schrire, R.A. (ed). 1990. Critical choices for South Africa. an agenda for the nineties. Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

Seager, D.H. 1994. A case study of integrated schooling within a co-educational high school in the Durban area. M.Ed. Thesis, University of Natal.

Sisulu, Z. 1986. People's education for people's power. Transformation, 1:96-117.

Smith, A.D. 1991. Umtata high: a success in multiracial education. Education and Culture, 14(2):22-23.

Smith, A., Downs, A., Lachman, M.L. 1973. Achieving effective desegregation. Lexington: Lexington Books.

Snelling, H.F. 1993. The transition from open schools to multiculturally sensitive schools. M.Ed. Thesis, Rand Afrikaans University.

South African Institute of Race Relations. 1995. Race relations survey: 1994-1995. Johannesburg: SAIRR.

South African Institute of Race Relations. 1994. Race relations survey: 1993-1994. Johannesburg: SAIRR.

South African Institute of Race Relations. 1992. Race relations survey: 1991-1992. Johannesburg: SAIRR.

South African Institute of Race Relations. 1978. South Africa in travail: the disturbances of 1976/1977. Johannesburg: SAIRR.

Southern African Catholic Bishops Conference. The Bishops Speak, Vols 1 & 2. Pretoria: SACBC.

Spitz, A. 1992. Colouring in our classrooms (video cassette). EPU, University of the Witwatersrand.

Squelch, J. 1993. Education for equality: the challenge to multicultural education. In Dekker, E.I. and Lemmer, E.M. (eds). Critical issues in modern education. Durban: Butterworth.

Taylor, N. (ed). 1993. Inventing Knowledge. Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

Torres, L. 1995. Democratisation and transition. Journal of Comparative African Studies, 13:35-47.

Tikly, L. 1993. Levelling the playingfields whilst moving the goal posts: changing discourses on 'race' in apartheid education policy. Paper presented to Kenton at Olwandle Conference 29 October - 1 November. Unpublished.

Troyna, B. 1993. Racism and education. Buckingham: Open University Press.

Troyna, B. and Williams, J. 1986. Racism, education and the state. Kent: Croom Helm.

University of the Witwatersrand Law School. 1996. Summaries of the decisions in the Gauteng Education Bill and National Education Policy Bill. University of the Witwatersrand Law School web site. Unpublished.

Unterhalter, E. 1991. Changing Aspects of Reformism in Bantu Education. In Unterhalter, E. et al (eds). Apartheid Education and Popular Struggles.

Unterhalter, E. Wolpe, H. Botha, T. (eds). 1991. Education in a future South Africa: policy issues for transformation. London: Heineman.

Unterhalter, E., et al. (eds.) 1991. Apartheid education and popular struggles. Johannesburg: Ravan Press.

Van Vuuren, D.J. (ed). 1985. South Africa: a plural society in transition. Durban: Butterworths.

Van der Merwe, S. 1986. The National Party's reform program. Africa Report 31(2).

Verma, G.K. and Bagley, C. (eds). 1975. Race and education across cultures. London: Heineman.

Vice, H. 1991. Attitudes of white teachers towards racial integration of schools in South Africa. M.Ed. Thesis. Johannesburg: University of Witwatersrand.

Willey, R. 1984. Race, equality and schools. London: Methuen.

Williams, J. 1985. Redefining institutional racism. Ethnic and Racial Studies, 8(3):323-348.